REMARKS

Claims 1-3, 7-15, 17 and 26 stand rejected in the subject patent application. Claims 3-6, 16 and 18-25 have been canceled. Pending claim 27 was withdrawn from consideration as being directed to a provisionally non-elected species of the present invention. This amendment adds new claim 28. Therefore, claims 1, 2, 7-15, 17, 26 and 28 will be pending following entry of this amendment.

Rejection Under 35 U.S.C. §112

Claims 14, 15, 17 and 26 have been were rejected under the first paragraph of 35 U.S.C. §112 because of a lack of support in the specification for the recitation in claim 14 that the second perimeter of the second work surface has an identical geometric shape as the <u>first work surface</u> (emphasis added).

This rejection has been overcome by amending claim 14 to state that second perimeter of the second work surface has an identical geometric shape as the first perimeter of the first work surface. The standard dictionary definition of a "perimeter" is "the boundary of a closed plane figure", see *Mirriam Webster's Collegiate Dictionary - Tenth Edition*, Mirriam Webster Inc., 1994, p 863 (copy enclosed). Paragraph [0047] of the specification when referring to Figures 12 and 13 states that the concave basin 132 with a first work surface 135 has an elliptical perimeter. Then paragraph [0047] describes the removable platform 136 as having an elliptical second work surface 142, thereby connoting an elliptical perimeter. Figure 13 clearly shows that the first work surface 135 and the second work surface 136 have perimeters with identical shapes, i.e. both perimeter are elliptical. Note that the geometric shape of an object does not denote its size and two different sized objects can have the same shape.

Therefore, this rejection of claims 14, 15, 17 and 26 should be withdrawn.

Rejections Under 35 U.S.C. §§102 & 103

Claims 1, 2, and 7-10 were rejected under 35 U.S.C. §102 as anticipated by De Bie. This rejection has been rendered moot by the amendment of claim 1 which incorporates the subject matter of claim 3 and now specifies that the first and second work surfaces are elliptical. Neither the sink body nor the platform of De Bie has an elliptical work surface. Nor is it apparent how the dishwashing apparatus in this patent could be made elliptical.

Claim 14 has been rejected under 35 U.S.C. §103 as being unpatentable over De Bie in view of Clow. This claim specifies a plumbing fixture body that has a first work surface with a first perimeter, and a platform that includes a second work surface with a second perimeter having an <u>identical</u> geometric shape as the first perimeter. The Office Action contends that it would be obvious to provide the shape of the upstanding portion of De Bie to be identical or similar as taught by elements b' and b" in Clow.

The obvious combination of the devices in the two patents would be to place the dishwashing apparatus shown in De Bie into the sink of Clow. However, doing so would not teach the claimed first and second work surfaces with identically shaped perimeters

Furthermore, De Bie teaches a dishwashing apparatus that is removably inserted into a sink and includes a rectangular tray 11 surrounded by a wall 17 and on which a separate dish pan 16 can be placed. That dishwashing apparatus also has a rack area 22-27 with a plurality of slots 28 which can hold plates in an upstanding manner for draining. In contrast, Clow teaches a sink that includes an island with an upper surface b" surrounded

by a trough with an annular bottom surface b'. All the components of the Clow sink are screwed or bolted together to form a single unitized structure during operation. Because of the dissimilarity between the removable dishwashing rack in De Bie and the fixedly assembled sink in De Bie, it is logical and unlikely for a skilled artisan to look to the surfaces of the Clow sink to use as surfaces of the dishwashing rack in De Bie. Components that are bolted together to form a sink do not suggest using one of those components as part of the rack that removably fits into a sink.

In addition, the surfaces of Clow cited by the rejection have oval perimeters whereas the De Bie apparatus has square and rectangular surfaces. It is unclear how the tray 11 or the rack 21-27 of De Bie could be made with elliptical surfaces and still have those sections fit together, much less be formed by a single sheet of bent material as shown in the patent.

Therefore, the Office Action has not made a *prima facie* case of obviousness with respect to claim 14 based on De Bie and Clow.

Claims 10 and 11 were rejected under 35 U.S.C. §103 as being unpatentable over De Bie in view of Hennessy.

Claims 10 and 11 are patentable over De Bie for the same reasons as stated above with respect to independent claim 1 from which these claims depend. As stated above, there is no suggestion as to why or how a person of ordinary skill in the art could modify the De Bie dishwashing apparatus to have elliptical surfaces. Nothing in Hennessy suggests the body and a platform of a washing apparatus having elliptical perimeters. Therefore, the amendment to claim 1 also overcomes the rejection of claims 10 and 11.

Claims 1-3, 7-8, and 14-15 were rejected under 35 U.S.C. §102 based on Clow.

Independent claim 1 requires that during washing use the platform both is movably positioned on the first work surface and is unfastened to the body. That is not true with respect to the sink in Clow which is formed by a plurality of sections that are bolted together to form the unitized structure. The rejection considers plate b" to correspond to the platform. However, that "platform" is bolted to the top of other sections of the sink and is not movable or unfastened to the body during washing use. In fact, removing the platform would be contrary to the teaching in this reference as doing so exposes a seam between island walls b seen in Fig. 3, through which water would flow onto the floor if left uncovered. Therefore, nothing suggests a desirability unbolt and remove the plate b" during washing use.

In addition, neither the first perimeter of a first work surface or the second perimeter of the second work surface is elliptical. Instead, both of those surfaces are oval shaped having long straight sides A. Therefore, claims 1-3, 7 and 8 are not anticipated under 35 U.S.C. §102.

Independent claim 14 also states that during washing use the platform is both movably positioned on the first work surface and unfastened to the body. As noted with respect to claim 1, there is no platform in the references that corresponds to this structure. Furthermore, dependent claim 15 specifies that both the first and second work surfaces have elliptical perimeters. As noted previously, the perimeters of the different work surfaces of the Clow sink are oval with straight sides and are not elliptical. Therefore, claims 14 and 15 have not been anticipated.

Claims 12 and 13 stand rejected under 35 U.S.C. §103 as being unpatentable over Clow in view of Bogusz.

Claims 12 and 13 depend from claim 1 which is noted previously specifies that during washing use the platform is both movably positioned on the first work surface and unfastened to the body. The Clow sink, in which various sections are bolted together, does not provide nor suggest such a platform, as noted in detail above. The Bogusz patent teaches a dishwashing device that is placed over a drain opening to allow a sink to be partially filled with water and still provide a drain passage that prevents the sink from over flowing. The dishwashing aid in Bogusz was cited as corresponding to the bowl in claims 12 and 13. However, this latter patent does not teach a movable unfastened platform as specified in the parent claim 1 which key feature still is not suggested when the teachings of Clow and Bogusz are combined.

Claim 17 was rejected under 35 U.S.C. §103 as being unpatentable over Clow in view of De Bie.

The obvious combination of the teachings in these patents would be to place the dishwashing apparatus shown in De Bie into the sink of Clow. However, doing so would not produce the claimed structure.

Claim 17 specifies that the platform has a plurality of legs that raise the second work surface from the first work surface. As best understood, this rejection is contending that the flat work surface b" of Clow could be unbolted from the remaining portions of the sink and supported by legs as shown in De Bie. That concept is not remotely suggested by the teachings of the references. Specifically, there is nothing that suggests to one skilled in the

art to separate the platform b" in Clow from the remaining components of the sink as doing

so would uncover a seam allowing water to leak onto the floor. Furthermore, integrating

walls b with the platform b" in Clow would create a seam the bottom of the wall b abuts the

bottom A" also allowing water to leak onto the floor. It is well settled that in order to reject

a structure as being obvious, the references must implicitly or expressly suggest the claimed

combination. It is respectfully submitted that the rejection has not shown that suggestion.

New claim 28 is patentable for the reasons previously stated with respect to claim

14 from which it depends.

Withdrawn claim 27 should be reinstated as is parent claim 14 is allowable and

generically covers the subject matter.

Conclusion

In view of these distinctions between the subject matter of the present claims and

teachings of the cited patents, reconsideration and allowance of the present application

are requested.

Respectfully submitted, James M. Piatt. et al.

Dated: September 9, 2005

Registration No. 27,642

Quarles & Brady LLP

411 E. Wisconsin Avenue Suite 2040

Milwaukee, WI 53202-4497

Telephone (414) 277-5751

OBMKE\5782659.1



Webster's Collegiate Dictionary

TENTH EDITION

Merriam-Webster, Incorporated Springfield, Massachusetts, U.S.A.

ndamus) b on absolute call 3 a trance (how b: indica-ic) (~ disre-mp-to-ri-ly remp-to-ri-

juror) made

g [L peren-\per-ə-nā-

ut + annus asons of the cous growth DURING (~ ANT. PERPETrly repeated yn see con-

structuring] nstituted by

s, fr. pp. of to make, do it or defect ACCURATE (a ~ gentle-TER-PERFECT | ~) 3 a LETE c obs | e : of an lishness > 4 m or verbal eaking or at D. SATISFIED son, fourth, d and when ninished 8 b : having per-fect-

ulty in any ice of every ike a whole riving from Beethoven its natural

hal form 2

ge; also: a

ct quiniela] d place fin-

of adhesive

cher allows

capable of

ection, fr. L state of be-LESSNESS b : an exem-ree of accu-

ctrine that ghest good n is attain-perfection per-fec-

a: tend action as or result tive ness

2: to a of whose

tus] (1894)

are root is

per-thorr exagger-

character-per-fid-

per-fi-dy \par-fa-de\ n. pl -dies [L perfidia, fr. perfidus faithless, fr. per-detrimental to + fides faith more at PER-FATH] (1592) 1: the quality or state of being faithless or disloyal: TREACHERY 2: an act or an instance of disloyalty per-fo-late \par-fo-fo-le-at, 'par-\ adj [NL perfolidia,' an herb having leaves pierced by the stem, fr. L per through + foliata, fem. of foliatus foliate] (1687): having the basal part naturally united around the stem (a ~ leaf of a honeysuckle) per-fo-rate \par-fo-rate vp-r-fo-rate vb-r-fo-rate vp-r-fo-rate vb-r-fo-rate vb

ual: PAROLE; also: the ability to speak a certain language — compare COMPETENCE 3

performance art n (1971): a nontraditional art form that consists of or features a performance by the artist — performance artist n performative \(^{\text{or-ma-tive}}\) \(^{\text{or-ma-tor-ma-tor-e}}\) \(^{\text{or-ma-tor-ma-tor-ma-tor-e}}\) \(^{\text{or-ma-tor-ma-tor-ma-tor-ma-tor-e}}\) \(^{\text{or-ma-tor-ma-tor-ma-tor-ma-tor-ma-tor-ma-tor-ma-tor-ma-tor-e}}\) \(^{\text{or-ma-tor-ma-

per-fum-er \po(r)-'fyü-mər, pər-\n n \cdots 1000, 1 a sells perfumers \po(r)-'fyü-mə-rē, -'fyüm-rē\n, pl-er-ies (1800) 1 a the art or process of making perfume b: the products made by a perfumer 2: an establishment where perfumers are made per-func-to-ry \por-fan(k)-(t-o)-rè\n alg [LL perfunctionius, fr. L perfungi to accomplish, get through with, fr. per-through + fungi to perform—more at PER. FUNCTION] (1593) 1: characterized by routine or superficiality: MECHANICAL (a ~ smile) 2: lacking in interest or enthusiasm—per-func-to-ri-ly \-(t-o)-ro-l\(\tilds\) adv—per-func-to-ri-ness \-(t-o)-r\(\tilds\) a solution

more at PER., FUNCTION] (1393) 1: cnaracterized by routine or superficiality: MECHANICAL (a ~ smile) 2: lacking in interest or enthusiasm — per-func-to-ri-ly \-t(2-)ro-l\(\tilde\) adv — per-func-to-ri-ness \-t(2-)r\(\tilde\)-r\(\tilde

scended from fallen angels and excluded from paradise until penance is accomplished 2: a beautiful and graceful girl peri- prefix [L, fr. Gk, around, in excess, fr. peri; akin to Gk peran to pass through — more at rake] 1: all around: about (periscope) 2: near (perihelion) 3: enclosing: surrounding (perinculum) peri-anth \peri-ant()th\ n [NL perianthium, fr. peri + Gk anthos flower — more at ANTHOLOGY] (1828): the floral structure comprised of the calyx and corolla esp. when the two whorls are fused — see FLOWER illustration

of the calyx and corolla esp, when the two whorls are fused — see FLOWER illustration peri-apt \peri-apt \n [MF or Gk; MF periapte, fr. Gk periapton, fr. periaptein to fasten around (oneself), fr. peri- + haptein to fasten [1584]: AMULET peri-car-di-al \peri-car-di-al \peri-car-di-al \peri-car-di-al \peri-car-di-al \n [NL] (ca. 1799): inflammation of the pericar-di-tis \-kär-di-ts\ n [NL] (ca. 1799): inflammation of the pericar-di-minus (ca. 1799): inflammation (ca. 17

ing the pericardium; also: situated around the heart
peri-car-di-tis _kär-di-təs\ n [NL] (ca. 1799): inflammation of the
peri-car-di-tim _'kär-di-təs\ n [NL] (ca. 1799): inflammation of the
peri-car-di-tim _'kär-di-təs\ n [NL] (ca. 1799): inflammation of the
peri-car-di-tim _'kär-di-təs\ n [NL] (ca. 1799): inflammation of the
peri-car-di-tim _'kär-di-tos\ around, the heart, fr. peri- + kardia
heart - more at HEART] (150): 1: the conical sac of serous membrane
that encloses the heart and the roots of the great blood vessels of vertebrates 2: a cavity or space that contains the heart of an invertebrate
and in arthropods is a part of the hemocoel
peri-carp _'ber->-kärp\ n [NL pericarpium, fr. Gk perikarpion pod, fr.
peri- + karpion -carp] (1759): the ripened and variously modified
walls of a plant ovary -- see ENDOCARP illustration
peri-chon-dri-um __per->-kän-dri-əm\ n. pl -dria _drie-_ [NL, fr.
peri- + Gk chondros grain, cartilage] (1741): the membrane of fibrous
connective tissue that invests cartilage except at joints. -- peri-chondral _drol_ daj

peri-c-o-pe _po-_ri-ko-pe\ n [LL, fr. Gk perikopē section, fr. peri- +
kopē act of cutting, fr. koptein to cut -- more at CAPON] (1658): a selection from a book; specif: LECTION.1

peri-c-a-ni-um _per-o-\kra-ni-m n, pl -nia _ne-o_ [ME pericraneum,
fr. ML, fr. Gk perikranion, neut. of perikranios around the skull; fr.
peri- + kranion skull -- peri-cra-ni-ul _ne-o_nail
peri-cy-cle _per-o-si-kol\ n [Fr. pericy-cle, fr. Gk. perikyklos spherical, fr.
peri- + kyklos circle -- more at WHEEL (ca. 1892): a thin layer of
parenchymatous or selerenchymatous cells that surrounds the stele in
most vascular plants -- peri-cy-clic _peri-cy-si-klik, 'si-\ adj
peri-derm _per-o-dorm\ n [NL peridermis, fr. peri- + dermis] (1849)
: an outer layer of tissue; esp: a cortical protective layer of manyiroots
and stems that typically consists of phellem, phellogen; and phelloderm

and steins that typically consists of phenicin, pheniogen, and phenioderm

peridi-ium 'pa-'ri-de-m' n, pl perid-ia \-de-\(\) [NL, fr. Gk peridion,
dim. of pera leather bag] (ca. 1823): the outer envelope of the sporophore of many fungi

per-idot \'per-\(\)per-\(\)data', \-d\(\)G(t)\\ n [F péridot, fr. OF peritot] (ca. 1706): a

deep yellowish green transparent olivine used as a gem \(\)—per-ido-itc \(\)per-\(\)data', \-d\(\)G(\(\)\\ adj\)

per-ido-tite \(\)po-\(\)ri-d-\(\), \iii \(\) n [F péridotite, fr. péridot] (1878): any of a

group of granitoid igneous rocks composed of ferromagnesian minerals
and esp. olivine \(\)—per-id-\(\)dittitic \(\)po-\(\)ri-d-\(\)-ti-tik\\(\) adj\)

peri-gee \(\)'per-\(\)-(.)j\(\)\(\) n [MF, fr. NL perigeum, fr. Gk perigeion, fr. neut.
of perigeios near the earth, fr. peri-\(\)+ ge earth] (1594): the point in the
orbit of an object cas a satellite) orbiting the earth that is nearest to the
center of the earth, also: the point nearest a planet or a satellite (as the
moon) reached by an object orbiting it \(\)—compare ApogeE \(\)—peri-ge
an \(\),per-\(\)-\(\)-\(\) jen n dj

moon) reached by an object of thing it — compare it of an \ner-a-je-an\ adj

pe-rig-y-nous\ \npa-ri-ja-nos\ adj [NL perigynus, fr. peri- + -gynus -gynous] (1807): borne on a ring or cup of the receptacle surrounding a pistil \(\simes \text{petals} \); also: having perigynous starnens and petals \(\simes \text{petals} \); also:

a pistil (~ petals); also: having perigynous stamens and petals (~ flowers)—perigy-ny \-n\tilde{n} peri-hel-yon \(n, pl \)-he-lia \-'h\tilde{l}-yo\ [NL, fr. peri-+Gk h\tilde{l} lios sun — more at SOLAR] (1666): the point in the path of a celestial body (as a planet) that is nearest to the sun — compare APH-ELION — peri-he-lial \-'hel-yo\ adj
peri-kar-yoon \-'kar-\tilde{c}-\tilde{n}, \-n\n \ n, pl -kar-ya \-\tilde{c}-\tilde{o}-\tilde{l} [NL, fr. peri-+Gk kar-yoon nut, kernel — more at CAREEN] (1897): CELL BODY — peri-kar-y-al \-\tilde{c}-\tilde{o}\) \(n [ME, fr. OF, fr. L periculum — more at FEAR] (13c) \\
1: exposure to the risk of being injured, destroyed, or lost: DANGER (fire put the city in ~) 2: something that imperils: RISK (lessen the ~s of the streets) \\
2-peril \\ '= lied also -illed; -il-ing also -il-ling (1567): to expose to

²peril vt -iled also -illed; -il-ing also -il-ling (1567): to expose to

peril w -iled also -illed; -il-ing also -il-ling (1567): to expose to danger.

peril-la \pp-'ri-la\ n [NL] (1900): any of a genus (Perilla) of Asian mints that have a bilabiate fruiting calyx and rugose nutlets perilla oil n (1917): a light yellow drying oil that is obtained from seeds of perillas

peril-ous \per-a-los\ adj (14c): full of or involving peril: HAZARDOUS syn see DANGEROUS — peril-lous-ly adv — peril-ous-ness n peril-une \per-a-liun\ n [peri-+ L luna moon — more at LUNAR] (1960): the point in the path of a body orbiting the moon that is nearest to the center of the moon — compare APOLUNE peril-lymph \-\lim(p)\n n [ISV] (ca. 1839): the fluid between the membranous and bony labyrinths of the ear per-time-ter \pp-'ri-ma-jan'\ n [ME perimetre, fr. L perimetros, fr. Gk, fr. peri- + metron measure — more at MEASURE] (15c) 1 a: the boundary of a closed plane figure b: the length of a perimeter 2: a line or strip bounding or protecting an area 3: outer limits — often used in pl.

line or strip bounding of protecting an action of the periony-si-um \per-o-'mi-zhē-əm, -zē-\ n, pl -sia \-zhē-ə, -zē-\ [NL, irreg. fr. peri- + Gk mys mouse, muscle — more at MOUSE] (ca. 1842); the connective-tissue sheath that surrounds a muscle and forms sheaths for the bundles of muscle fibers

\ə\ abut \angle \int \table \ər\ further \a\ ash \a\ ace \a\ mop, mar \y\ yet \zh\ vision \a, k, n, ce, ce, ue, ue, ve Guide to Pronunciation